



Women's Hatzolah Ezras Noshim

Show# 245 | Nov 9th 2019

פרשת לך לך פרק טו

- (ה) ויזלא אתו החוצה ויאמר הבט-נא השמימה וספר הכוכבים אמ-תוכל לספר אתם ויאמר לו פה יהיה זרעך:
(ט) ויאמר אליו קחה לי עגלה משלשת ועז משלשת ואיל משלש ותר וגזל:
(י) ויקח-לו את-כל-אלה ויבחר אתם בתוך ויתן איש-בתרו לקראת רעהו ואת-הצפר לא בחר:
(יא) וירד העיט על-הפגרים וישב אתם אברם:
(יב) ויהי השמש לבוא ותרדמה נפלה על-אברם והנה אימה חשכה גדלה נפלת עליו:

Riddles of the week

תלמוד בבלי מסכת גיטין דף נז עמוד ב

כי עליך הורגנו כל היום נחשבנו כצאן טבחה וכו'. ר' יהושע בן לוי אמר: זו מילה שניתנה בשמיני. ופרש"י זו מילה - הורגנו כל היום דזימנין דמיית.

תלמוד בבלי מסכת יומא דף פד עמוד ב

אמר רב יוסף אמר רב יהודה אמר שמואל: לא הלכו בפקוח נפש אחר הרוב.

פרקי דרבי אליעזר פרק כט

נפיון השמיני, ויהי אברם בן תשעים שנה ותשע שנים [בראשית יז, א]. אמר לו הקדוש ברוך הוא התהלך לפני ויהי תמים [שם א]. אמר לו הקדוש ברוך הוא, עד עכשו לא היית תמים לפני, אלא מל בשר ערלתך מעליך והתהלך לפני ויהי תמים, שהערלה טמאה היא מכל הטמאות, שנאמר [ישעיה נב, א] לא יוסיף יבא בך עוד ערל

וטמא. שהעֶרְלָה מוּם היא מְכַל מוּמִים. מל אֶת בֶּשֶׂר עֶרְלָתָהּ, וְהִתְהַלֵּךְ לִפְנֵי יְהוָה תָּמִים. רבן גמליאל אומר שלח וקרא לשם בן נח, ומל אֶת בֶּשֶׂר עֶרְלָתוֹ וּבֶשֶׂר עֶרְלַת יִשְׁמַעֵאל בְּנוֹ, שֶׁנֶּאֱמַר [שם כו] בְּעֶצֶם הַיּוֹם הַזֶּה נִמּוּל אֲבָרָהִם וַיִּשְׁמַעֵאל בְּנוֹ. מהו בעצם היום הזה, בגבורת השמש בחצי היום.

תלמוד בבלי מסכת פסחים דף ד עמוד א

זריזין מקדימין למצות - נבדוק מצפרא! דכתיב: וביום השמיני ימול בשר ערלתו ותניא: כל היום כולו כשר למילה, אלא שזריזין מקדימין למצות. שנאמר וישכם אברהם בבקר.

רמב"ם הלכות מילה פרק א הלכה ח

אין מלין לעולם אלא ביום אחר עלות השמש, בין ביום השמיני שהוא זמנה בין ה שלא בזמנה שהוא מתשיעי והלאה שנאמר ביום השמיני ביום ולא בלילה, מל משעלה עמוד השחר כשר, וכל היום כשר למילה, ואעפ"כ מצוה להקדים בתחלת היום שזריזין מקדימין למצות.

שולחן ערוך יורה דעה הלכות מילה סימן רסב סעיף א

אין מלין עד שתנץ החמה ביום השמיני ללידתו. וכל היום כשר למילה, אלא שזריזין מקדימין למצות ומלין מיד בבקר.

Comments on the Show

Comments on the show **1** *click here*

Comments on the show **2** *click here*

Comments on the show **3** *click here*

Comments on the show **4** *click here*

Comments on the show **5** *click here*

Comments on the show **6** *click here*

Comments on the show **7** *click here*

Comments on the show **8** *click here*

Comments on the show **9** *click here*

Comments on the show **10** *click here*

Comments on the show **11** *click here*

Comments on the show **12** *click here*

Comments on the show **13** *click here*

Comments on Previous Shows

Show 236 – Yeshivish VS Lubavitch

Comments on the show 1 *click here*

Show 243 – Open Orthodoxy

Comments on the show 1 *click here*

Comments on the show 2 *click here*

Comments on the show 3 *click here*

Show 244 – Employment Law in Halacha

Comments on the show 1 *click here*

Selected emails from our listeners

Answers to the Questions

Regarding the question why Abraham waited to do Mitzvas Milah.

It is discussed by many that he waited to be commanded on Milah rather than do it before on his own.

Additionally, its darkened that he did it on the day he was commanded.

Furthermore, he was making a point by doing it in broad daylight at midday.

In that case, he didn't push off doing it, but rather waited to be commanded and waited to make the point for everyone to see.

Even the mitzvah of the Akaida where Zrizin is learned from he waited to the following morning.

If the mitzvah of Milah was told to him earlier in the day and he waited till midday, than the question remains. However, it may be that the point he was making to do it at midday overrode the Zrizin component.

In any event, it's an interesting question and observation.

Thank you,

amazonnysn@gmail.com

Comments on the Show

My wife has seizures and at times I have to call Hatzolah to get help when she falls to the floor, since I am almost 70 and recently had surgery. Therefore, I have Hatzolah on "quick dial" on my cell phone. I suggest this so that no error will be made as mentioned on the show "Ezras Noshim".

Melech

I enjoyed the discussion on this week's episode. Please see the link below for a recent article from Arutz Sheva discussing a woman's perspective in United Hatzalah in Israel. It seems like they are able to deal with the issue of women working as EMTs alongside men.

<https://vosizneias.com/2019/11/11/female-emts-bringing-dignity-to-chaos/>

Kol Tuv,

Jonathan Mazurek, MD

Shalom Aleichem Rav David,

Thank you again for your show - I learn a lot from you every single week.

Regarding your show this week -

I agree with all of your points against Ezrat Nashim whether it's:

1. Allocation of resources
2. Not well trained
3. It prevents people from calling Hatzalah and actually getting help

However, I felt that too much blame was placed on the side of Ezrat Nashim and not enough on Hatzalah which doesn't accept any women volunteers. If Hatzalah just accepted women volunteers it would solve all of these issues and Ezrat Nashim wouldn't need to exist. I was even more upset when this was not pushed further when Rav Schachter clearly said that women should be in Hatzalah.

I don't really understand the Metziut in America, but in Eretz Yisrael (where my wife and I both just completed the course to become Hatzalah volunteers)

Hatzalaha serves as the first responder, who stabilizes the patient before the ambulance (Magen David Adom not Hatzala usually) brings the patient to the hospital.

This works because medics who are closest to the call have GPS technology which lets the 5 closest medics know exactly where the call is. By allowing women into Hatzalah

they have twice as many responders so the response rates are much quicker thus saving valuable time in saving someone's life.

Even in the more Charedi/Chasidish neighborhoods, they have established what is called a Yechidat Nashim (women's unit) - women who are trained by Hatzalah and supported by the Hatzalah network - to be the first ones at calls for women.

Again, I appreciated the show and I learned a lot. I personally hope that the next step would be for Hatzalah and Ezrat Nashim to merge, for women to get the proper medical training and figure out how to make it work in the best Halachic way in order to save more lives.

Kol Tuv,

Ami Ungar

Dear R' Lichtenstein,

I appreciate listening to your podcast. I can't tell you how much both my husband and I enjoy it, and benefit from how it helps us to have a deeper understanding of the major Hashkafic issues facing Jewish communities today, especially since we do not live in such a community (so this also helps us feel more in touch)! It is so inspiring to hear someone like you who is learned, steeped in Yiras Shomayim, and also engaged and in touch with everyday life, and so we value your perspective all the more so.

I just listened to the Ezras Nashim episode and was disheartened to not hear the perspective of a single woman. From your other episodes, I perceived that you are a Menschlach person and respect women as creative, productive contributors to society so I was rather surprised that you would go ahead with such a one-sided presentation of an issue. I know you said that you tried to have representatives from Ezras Nashim (EN) come on the podcast and that they did not comply, but then, I'm sorry to suggest, you should not present such an episode at all (or, try to get a user's perspective or at least, any woman!). Furthermore, you read aloud stories of unknown origin that shed only negative light on the organization. I'm sure it can't be too difficult to get a story or

quote from someone who benefited from EN to provide a positive counterbalance. In one particular story you read, someone mentioned that the EN volunteer wore a wedding dress. I'm wondering why this is relevant. Would someone mention this detail about a Hatzolah volunteer member ("he was wearing his white cufflink shirt")? Inherent in this comment, is the perception that women care more about looking good than saving someone's life which perpetuates a certain stereotype that is just not based on facts. What about the fact that it's mostly women who wake up in the middle of the night to care for their babies and urgent needs of family members? Who has the faster response time then? Unfortunately, women don't get 'credit' for similar tasks that are part of their everyday routines (how many women have to try to move forward with their days at work despite interrupted sleep on a long-term basis?). None of this is meant to discredit the work Hatzolah members do - I would greatly value a Bracha from them, too!

I wonder whether you've the seen the documentary 93 Queen? That alone would've provided enough positive evidence to present a balanced review of EN.

What bothered me even more was the fact that a handful of men on this episode felt they could determine women's feelings about whether there's a need for such a service. If women are calling EN, then clearly there's a need, no? I found it difficult to digest a discussion about whether women felt embarrassed or not, without directly bringing a woman into the conversation.

Finally, regarding response time, obviously this is a serious issue as it touches on Pikuah Nefesh. However, absent from this argument was any recognition that it's a new organization - I wonder what Hatzolah response time was when they started back in the 60's? That's not to say that we as a community should suffer from prolonged response times just to empower an organization, but the organization should be offered more support and opportunities to train and observe, etc. And perhaps in the meantime, should deal with only urgent care/non-emergencies until response time improves (if all those facts were true).

Personally, I have no ties to EN and I'm not even sure where I stand on the matter (probably more in line with just better cooperation, as suggested by R' Schachter), and

as you said, whether it justifies community funds, etc. However, I was just frustrated overall by the narrow presentation of this issue, when it might've been better to just not highlight the issue at all (or at least until you could ascertain a more balanced presentation).

I hope you understand that I only write this email out of the greatest respect and value for the work you do; otherwise, I wouldn't even bother responding.

Of course, I will continue to listen to and support your podcast and I really do appreciate your efforts to highlight issues of Hashkafic concern for us! May Hashem continue to bless you with many more years of being Mashpiah Klal Yisrael and with the Nachas to always see the fruits of your labour!

Rachel Oser

Response:

Thank you, we do a show every week that has to be posted by Shabbos.

The head of Ezras Nashim, Ruchie Frier, agreed to be interviewed and pulled out on Wednesday / Thursday. This has almost never happened to us.

We didn't have the time to get another person even though we tried to scramble and get one.

The only option was to have a week without a program, which we didn't want to do.

So we ended up w where we did.

Rabbi Zeidah

שולחן ערוך אורח חיים הלכות שבת סימן שכח סעיף יב

כשמחללין שבת על חולה שיש בו סכנה, משתדלין שלא לעשות ע"י א"י וקטנים **ונשים** אלא ע"י ישראלים גדולים ובני דעת.

משנה ברורה על שולחן ערוך אורח חיים הלכות שבת סימן שכח סעיף יב

שלא לעשות וכו' - הטעם כתב הרא"ש משום דזימנין דליתנייהו ואתי ג"כ לאהדורי בתרייהו ומתוך כך יבוא לידי סכנה וטעם זה שייך גבי קטנים וא"י ואצל נשים איכא טעם אחר שמא יאמרו שלא ניתן שבת לדחות אף בפקוח נפש ולכך מוסרין אותה להם ויתעצלו בדבר ומתוך כך יבוא לידי סכנה או שמא יקילו הנשים בדבר ויבואו לחלל שבת במקום אחר [רמב"ם]:

אלא ע"י וכו' - וכשיש שם במעמד זה חכמים מצוה לכתחלה לעשות חלול זה על ידיהם [ר"מ פי' המשנה פ' מפנין וריא"ז ותשב"ץ ח"א סימן נ"ח /נ"ד/]. ודע דכל סעיף זה מיירי שכולם עומדים באותו מעמד אבל אי ליכא שם אנשים ויש נשים שם בודאי אין להם להמתין והם זריזות ונשכרות [תשב"ץ וריא"ז]:

תלמוד בבלי מסכת סוטה דף כא עמוד ב

הוא היה אומר: חסיד שוטה כו'. היכי דמי חסיד שוטה? כגון דקא טבעה איתתא בנהרא, ואמר: לאו אורח ארעא לאיסתכולי בה ואצולה.

Simcha Shain

תלמוד בבלי מסכת קידושין דף פב עמוד א

כל שעסקיו עם הנשים לא יתיחד עם הנשים. ולא ילמד אדם את בנו אומנות עם הנשים. תנו רבנן: כל שעסקיו עם הנשים - סורו רע.